

Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	1-1
2. Method and Related Work.....	2-1
2.1 Challenge Problem.....	2-1
2.1.1 Current State of the Art.....	2-2
2.1.1.1 Empirical Studies.....	2-2
2.1.1.2 Simulation Studies.....	2-3
2.1.1.3 Analytical Studies.....	2-3
2.1.2 Proposed Advance in the State of the Art.....	2-4
2.2 Potential Approaches.....	2-4
2.2.1 Expanded Empirical Studies.....	2-5
2.2.2 Expanded Simulation Studies.....	2-5
2.2.3 Expanded Analytical Studies.....	2-7
2.3 Selected Approach.....	2-7
2.4 Hard Problems.....	2-8
2.4.1 Model Scale.....	2-8
2.4.2 Model Validation.....	2-8
2.4.3 Tractable Analysis.....	2-9
2.4.4 Causal Analysis.....	2-9
2.4.5 Experiment Selection.....	2-9
2.5 Selected Solutions and Possible Alternatives.....	2-10
2.5.1 Scale Reduction.....	2-10
2.5.2 Sensitivity Analysis and Key Empirical Comparisons.....	2-14
2.5.3 Statistical Analysis Methods.....	2-15
2.5.4 Data-Supported Domain Expertise.....	2-18
2.5.5 Domain Expertise and Incremental Design.....	2-20
2.6 Conclusions.....	2-22
3. Description of MesoNetHS.....	3-1
3.1 Model Structure.....	3-1
3.1.1 Model Elements.....	3-2
3.1.1.1 Sources.....	3-2
3.1.1.2 Receivers.....	3-4
3.1.1.3 Access Routers.....	3-5
3.1.1.4 Point-Of-Presence Routers.....	3-6
3.1.1.5 Backbone Routers.....	3-6
3.1.1.6 Backbone Links.....	3-7
3.1.2 Network Topology.....	3-7
3.1.2.1 Four-Tier Structure.....	3-10
3.1.2.2 Heterogeneous Composition.....	3-10
3.1.2.3 Flow Classes.....	3-10
3.1.2.4 Fixed- Path Routing.....	3-11
3.1.2.5 Simulated Abilene Backbone Characteristics.....	3-11
3.1.3 Simulated Packets.....	3-12
3.1.4 Relating Abstract Time to Real Time.....	3-13

3.2 Model Configuration.....	3-14
3.2.1 Simulation Control Parameters.....	3-14
3.2.2 Parameters Defining User Behavior.....	3-14
3.2.3 Parameters Adapting Network Topology.....	3-15
3.2.4 Parameters Describing Sources and Receivers.....	3-16
3.2.5 Parameters Specifying Special Long-Lived Flows.....	3-18
3.2.6 Parameters for Transport Protocols.....	3-20
3.2.7 Parameters Identifying Monitored Links.....	3-21
3.2.8 Reporting Parameter Settings.....	3-21
3.3 Model Measurements.....	3-21
3.3.1 General Measurement Regime.....	3-21
3.3.2 Summary Measures.....	3-22
3.3.3 Aggregate Measures.....	3-23
3.3.4 Flow-Class Measures.....	3-26
3.3.5 Long-Lived Flow Measures.....	3-28
3.3.6 Per-Router Measures.....	3-29
3.3.6.1 Measurements Common to All Routers.....	3-29
3.3.6.2 Measurements Unique to Access Routers.....	3-31
3.3.7 Optional Link-Level Measures.....	3-32
3.3.8 Augmenting Measures.....	3-32
3.4 Tracing Flow Behavior.....	3-34
3.4.1 Tracing Flow States.....	3-34
3.4.2 Tracing Packets.....	3-35
3.5 Notes on Model Construction with SLX.....	3-35
3.5.1 Configuration File.....	3-35
3.5.2 Topology File.....	3-36
3.5.3 Model Behavior File.....	3-37
3.5.3.1 Model Elements.....	3-37
3.5.3.2 Simulation Control.....	3-37
3.5.3.3 Measurement Buffers.....	3-38
3.5.4 Performance Properties of MesoNetHS.....	3-38
3.5.4.1 Processing Requirements.....	3-39
3.5.4.2 Memory Requirements.....	3-40
4. Sensitivity Analysis of MesoNetHS.....	4-1
4.1 Methodology.....	4-2
4.1.1 Experiment Design.....	4-3
4.1.1.1 Identify Factors.....	4-3
4.1.1.2 Select Number of Levels and Level Settings for Factors.....	4-3
4.1.1.3 Select Specific Combinations to Simulate.....	4-4
4.1.1.4 Select Responses to Examine.....	4-6
4.1.2 Correlation Analysis.....	4-6
4.1.2.1 Y-Y Scatter Plots.....	4-7
4.1.2.2 Correlation Computations.....	4-7
4.1.2.3 Combined Matrix Visualization.....	4-9
4.1.2.4 Index-Index Plot.....	4-10

4.1.3 Ten-Step Graphical Analysis.....	4-10
4.1.3.1 Ordered Data Plot.....	4-11
4.1.3.2 Scatter Plot.....	4-12
4.1.3.3 Main Effects Plot.....	4-13
4.1.3.4 Interaction Effects Matrix.....	4-14
4.1.3.5 Block Plots.....	4-15
4.1.3.6 Youden Plot.....	4-16
4.1.3.7 Effects Plot.....	4-17
4.1.3.8 Half-Normal Probability Plot of Effects	4-18
4.1.3.9 Cumulative Residual Standard Deviation Plot.....	4-19
4.1.3.10 Contour Plot of Two Dominant Factors.....	4-20
4.1.4 Other Exploratory Plots and Analyses.....	4-21
4.2 Experiment Design for MesoNetHS Sensitivity Analysis.....	4-23
4.2.1 MesoNetHS Factors.....	4-23
4.2.1.1 Simulation Control Parameters.....	4-23
4.2.1.2 Parameters Controlling User Behavior.....	4-24
4.2.1.3 Parameters Adapting Network Characteristics.....	4-24
4.2.1.4 Parameters Altering Properties of Sources and Receivers.....	4-25
4.2.1.5 Parameters Controlling Source Startup Pattern.....	4-26
4.2.1.6 Parameters Related to TCP Operation.....	4-26
4.2.1.7 Recap of Factors Selected for Sensitivity Analysis.....	4-27
4.2.2 Number of Levels and Settings for MesoNetHS Factors.....	4-28
4.2.2.1 Two-Level Factor Settings.....	4-28
4.2.2.2 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Network Factor Settings.....	4-28
4.2.2.3 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) User Factor Settings.....	4-30
4.2.2.4 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Source & Receiver Factor Settings.....	4-30
4.2.2.5 Rationale for (and Ramifications of) Protocol Factor Settings.....	4-33
4.2.3 Specific Combinations Simulated.....	4-33
4.2.4 Responses Examined.....	4-33
4.2.4.1 Responses Characterizing Macroscopic Network Behavior.....	4-34
4.2.4.2 Responses Characterizing User Experience.....	4-35
4.3 Experiment Execution.....	4-36
4.3.1 Resource Requirements for Simulations.....	4-36
4.3.2 Data Collection and Summarization.....	4-38
4.4 Correlation Analysis.....	4-40
4.5 Principal Components Analysis.....	4-44
4.6 Sensitivity Analysis.....	4-47
4.6.1 Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Correlation Analysis.....	4-47
4.6.1.1 Congestion-Related Responses.....	4-47
4.6.1.2 Delay-Related Responses.....	4-51

4.6.1.3 Responses Related to Macroscopic Throughput.....	4-51
4.6.1.4 Responses Related to Advantaged Flow Classes.....	4-52
4.6.2 Sensitivity Analysis Guided by Principal Component Analysis.....	4-56
4.6.2.1 Congestion.....	4-56
4.6.2.2 Delay.....	4-57
4.6.2.3 Throughput for Advantaged Flows.....	4-58
4.6.2.4 Macroscopic Throughput.....	4-60
4.6.3 Summary of Findings from the Sensitivity Analysis.....	4-61
4.6.3.1 Main Aspects of Model Behavior.....	4-61
4.6.3.2 Major Factors Influencing Model Behavior.....	4-63
4.6.3.3 Factors Exhibiting Little Influence on Model Behavior.....	4-64
4.7 Exploring Effects of Buffer Sizing.....	4-65
4.7.1 Effects on Delay Variation.....	4-66
4.7.2 Effects on Other Aspects of Network Behavior.....	4-67
4.8 Conclusions.....	4-70
5. Modeling Alternate Congestion-Control Mechanisms.....	5-1
5.1 TCP Congestion Control.....	5-2
5.1.1 Connection Phase.....	5-3
5.1.2 Transfer Phase – Slow Start.....	5-5
5.1.2.1 Standard Slow Start.....	5-6
5.1.2.2 Limited Slow Start.....	5-6
5.1.2.3 Setting Slow-Start Threshold.....	5-6
5.1.3 Transfer Phase – Congestion Avoidance.....	5-7
5.1.3.1 Increase Congestion Window after Acknowledgment.....	5-7
5.1.3.2 Decrease Congestion Window After Signaled Loss.....	5-7
5.1.3.3 Decrease Slow-Start Threshold and Reset Congestion Window after Timeout.....	5-8
5.1.3.4 Combined Effects of Slow Start and Congestion Avoidance.....	5-8
5.2 Congestion-Avoidance Procedures for Six Alternate Congestion-Control Mechanisms.....	5-10
5.2.1 BIC.....	5-10
5.2.1.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-11
5.2.1.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-11
5.2.1.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-12
5.2.2 CTCP.....	5-13
5.2.2.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-14
5.2.2.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-14
5.2.2.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-15
5.2.2.4 Periodic Procedures.....	5-15
5.2.3 FAST.....	5-15
5.2.3.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-17

5.2.3.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-17
5.2.3.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-17
5.2.3.4 Periodic Procedures.....	5-17
5.2.4 HSTCP.....	5-18
5.2.3.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-18
5.2.3.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-19
5.2.3.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-19
5.2.5 H-TCP.....	5-19
5.2.5.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-19
5.2.5.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-20
5.2.5.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-21
5.2.5.4 Periodic Procedures.....	5-21
5.2.6 Scalable TCP.....	5-21
5.2.6.1 Increase Procedures.....	5-22
5.2.6.2 Decrease Procedures.....	5-22
5.2.6.3 Timeout Procedures.....	5-22
5.3 Modeling the Transfer Phase in MesoNetHS.....	5-23
5.3.1 General Data Transfer Procedures.....	5-23
5.3.2 Slow Start.....	5-24
5.3.3 Congestion Avoidance.....	5-24
5.3.3.1 Acknowledgement Procedures.....	5-25
5.3.3.2 Negative Acknowledgement Procedures.....	5-25
5.3.3.3 Periodic Procedures.....	5-25
5.3.3.4 Timeout Procedures.....	5-25
5.4 Verifying Simulated Congestion-Control Mechanisms.....	5-25
5.4.1 Standard TCP Congestion-Control Model.....	5-27
5.4.2 Behavior of BIC Congestion-Control Model.....	5-28
5.4.3 Behavior of CTCP Congestion-Control Model.....	5-29
5.4.4 Behavior of FAST Congestion-Control Model.....	5-30
5.4.5 Behavior of HSTCP Congestion-Control Model.....	5-37
5.4.6 Behavior of H-TCP Congestion-Control Model.....	5-38
5.4.7 Behavior of Scalable TCP Congestion-Control Model.....	5-38
5.4.8 Summary of Behavior of MesoNetHS Congestion-Control Models.....	5-38
6. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Large, Fast Network.....	6-1
6.1 Experiment Design.....	6-1
6.1.1 Simulation Parameters.....	6-3
6.1.2 Conditions Simulated.....	6-7
6.1.3 Responses Measured.....	6-8
6.1.3.1 Measures of Macroscopic Behavior.....	6-8
6.1.3.2 Measures of User Experience.....	6-10
6.1.3.3 Measures of Buffer Usage.....	6-11
6.1.3.4 Aggregate Measures.....	6-12
6.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection.....	6-13
6.2.1 Experiment Execution.....	6-13
6.2.2 Data Collection.....	6-16

6.3 Data-Analysis Approach.....	6-17
6.3.1 Cluster Analysis.....	6-17
6.3.2 Detailed Analysis of Individual Responses.....	6-22
6.3.3 Condition-Response Summary Analysis.....	6-24
6.3.4 Data Exploration.....	6-26
6.3.4.1 Extrapolating from Time Series.....	6-26
6.3.4.2 Seeking Patterns.....	6-29
6.3.4.3 Investigating Data Subsets.....	6-30
6.3.4.4 Interactive Animation.....	6-31
6.4 Results.....	6-32
6.4.1 Time Period One (TP1).....	6-32
6.4.1.1 Cluster Analysis for TP1.....	6-33
6.4.1.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP1.....	6-33
6.4.1.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1.....	6-33
6.4.1.4 Summary of Results for TP1.....	6-38
6.4.2 Time Period Two (TP2).....	6-38
6.4.2.1 Cluster Analysis for TP2.....	6-38
6.4.2.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP2.....	6-39
6.4.2.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2.....	6-40
6.4.2.4 Summary of Results for TP2.....	6-40
6.4.3 Time Period Three (TP3).....	6-45
6.4.3.1 Cluster Analysis for TP3.....	6-45
6.4.3.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP3.....	6-45
6.4.3.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3.....	6-45
6.4.3.4 Summary of Results for TP3.....	6-51
6.4.4 Aggregated Responses (Totals).....	6-51
6.4.4.1 Cluster Analysis for Totals.....	6-51
6.4.4.2 Condition-Response Summary for Totals.....	6-52
6.4.4.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals.....	6-52
6.4.4.4 Summary of Results for Totals.....	6-55
6.5 Findings.....	6-55
6.5.1 Finding #1.....	6-55
6.5.2 Finding #2.....	6-58
6.5.3 Finding #3.....	6-63
6.5.4 Finding #4.....	6-65
6.5.5 Tendencies.....	6-66
6.6 Conclusions.....	6-67
7. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Scaled-Down Network.....	7-1
7.1 Experiment Design.....	7-2
7.1.1 Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors.....	7-2
7.1.2 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions.....	7-3
7.1.3 Domain View of Robustness Conditions.....	7-4
7.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection.....	7-8
7.3 Data-Analysis Approach.....	7-8
7.4 Results.....	7-10

7.4.1 Time Period One (TP1).....	7-11
7.4.1.1 Cluster Analysis for TP1.....	7-11
7.4.1.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP1.....	7-12
7.4.1.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP1.....	7-12
7.4.1.4 Summary of Results for TP1.....	7-18
7.4.2 Time Period Two (TP2).....	7-19
7.4.2.1 Cluster Analysis for TP2.....	7-19
7.4.2.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP2.....	7-19
7.4.2.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP2.....	7-19
7.4.2.4 Summary of Results for TP2.....	7-19
7.4.3 Time Period Three (TP3).....	7-26
7.4.3.1 Cluster Analysis for TP3.....	7-26
7.4.3.2 Condition-Response Summary for TP3.....	7-26
7.4.3.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for TP3.....	7-26
7.4.3.4 Summary of Results for TP3.....	7-26
7.4.4 Aggregated Responses (Totals).....	7-26
7.4.4.1 Cluster Analysis for Totals.....	7-32
7.4.4.2 Condition-Response Summary for Totals.....	7-32
7.4.4.3 Analysis of Significant Responses for Totals.....	7-34
7.4.4.4 Summary of Results for Totals.....	7-34
7.5 Findings.....	7-37
7.5.1 Finding #1.....	7-37
7.5.2 Finding #2.....	7-39
7.5.3 Finding #3.....	7-40
7.5.4 Finding #4.....	7-58
7.5.5 Tendencies.....	7-59
7.6 Conclusions.....	7-60
8. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in an Evolving Network.....	8-1
8.1 Experiment Design.....	8-2
8.1.1 Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors.....	8-2
8.1.1.1 Constraints on Flows of Large Size.....	8-5
8.1.1.2 Fixed Experiment Factors.....	8-7
8.1.2 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions.....	8-9
8.1.3 Domain View of Robustness Conditions.....	8-10
8.1.4 Responses Measured.....	8-15
8.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection.....	8-16
8.2.1 Computing Macroscopic Responses.....	8-17
8.2.2 Computing User-Experience Responses.....	8-20
8.3 Data-Analysis Approach.....	8-21
8.3.1 Analyzing Macroscopic Behavior.....	8-21
8.3.2 Analyzing User Experience.....	8-22
8.4 Results.....	8-27
8.4.1 Macroscopic Network Behavior.....	8-27
8.4.1.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-27
8.4.1.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-32

8.4.2 Absolute User Experience.....	8-37
8.4.2.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-37
8.4.2.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-46
8.4.2.3 Summary of Differences in Goodput.....	8-55
8.4.3 Relative User Experience.....	8-57
8.4.3.1 High Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-57
8.4.3.2 Low Initial Slow-start Threshold.....	8-65
8.4.3.3 Summary of Differences in Relative Goodput.....	8-55
8.5 Findings.....	8-75
8.5.1 Finding #1.....	8-75
8.5.2 Finding #2.....	8-76
8.5.3 Finding #3.....	8-76
8.5.4 Finding #4.....	8-76
8.6 Conclusions.....	8-77
9. Comparing Congestion-Control Regimes in a Large, Fast, Evolving Network.....	9-1
9.1 Changes in Experiment Design.....	9-2
9.1.1 Changes in Robustness Factors and Fixed Factors.....	9-2
9.1.2 Changes in Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Design of Robustness Conditions.....	9-3
9.1.3 Changes in Domain View of Robustness Conditions.....	9-4
9.1.4 Responses Measured.....	9-6
9.2 Experiment Execution and Data Collection.....	9-6
9.3 Data-Analysis Approach.....	9-6
9.4 Results.....	9-7
9.4.1 Macroscopic Network Behavior.....	9-7
9.4.2 Absolute User Experience.....	9-13
9.4.3 Relative User Experience.....	9-21
9.5 Findings.....	9-32
9.5.1 Finding #1.....	9-32
9.5.2 Finding #2.....	9-32
9.5.3 Finding #3.....	9-32
9.5.4 Finding #4.....	9-33
9.6 Conclusions	
10. Conclusions.....	10-1
10.1 Conclusions about Congestion-Control Algorithms.....	10-1
10.1.1 Utility and Safety of Alternate Congestion-Control Algorithms.....	10-1
10.1.1.1 Increase Rate.....	10-1
10.1.1.2 Loss/Recovery Processing.....	10-2
10.1.1.3 Fairness.....	10-3
10.1.1.4 Utility Bounds.....	10-4
10.1.1.5 Safety.....	10-5
10.1.2 Characteristics of Individual Congestion-Control Algorithms.....	10-6
10.2.1 BIC.....	10-6
10.2.2 CTCP.....	10-6

10.2.3 FAST.....	10-7
10.2.4 FAST-AT.....	10-7
10.2.5 HSTCP.....	10-7
10.2.6 HTCP.....	10-8
10.2.7 Scalable TCP.....	10-8
10.1.3 Recommendations.....	10-9
10.1.4 Future Work.....	10-9
10.2 Conclusions about Methods.....	10-10
10.2.1 Discrete-Event Simulation.....	10-10
10.2.2 Scale-Reduction Techniques.....	10-11
10.2.2.1 Mode Restriction and Parameter Clustering.....	10-11
10.2.2.2 Two-Level Experiment Designs.....	10-11
10.2.2.3 Orthogonal Fractional Factorial Experiment Designs.....	10-11
10.2.2.4 Correlation Analysis.....	10-12
10.2.2.5 Principal Components Analysis.....	10-12
10.2.3 Model-Validation Techniques.....	10-13
10.2.3.1 Sensitivity Analysis.....	10-13
10.2.3.2 Key Empirical Comparisons.....	10-13
10.2.4 Data-Analysis Methods.....	10-14
10.2.4.1 Ten-Step Graphical Analysis.....	10-14
10.2.4.2 Cluster Analysis.....	10-15
10.2.4.3 Custom Multidimensional Visualizations.....	10-15
10.2.4.4 Exploratory Multidimensional Interactive Visualization.....	10-15
10.2.5 Causality-Analysis Methods.....	10-16
10.2.5.1 Principal Components Analysis.....	10-16
10.2.5.2 Detailed Measurements.....	10-16
10.2.5.3 Scientific Method.....	10-17
10.2.5.4 Exploratory Analysis.....	10-18
10.2.6 Experiment-Selection Methods.....	10-18
10.2.6.1 Rank Analysis.....	10-18
10.2.6.2 Domain Expertise.....	10-18
10.2.6.3 Incremental Design.....	10-18
10.2.7 Recommendations.....	10-19
10.2.8 Future Work.....	10-20
11. Bibliography of References.....	11-1
11.1 Fundamentals of Internet Design.....	11-1
11.2 Standard Transmission Control Protocol (TCP).....	11-1
11.3 Internet Topology.....	11-2
11.4 Internet Traffic Characteristics.....	11-3
11.5 Internet Topology.....	11-3
11.6 Research on Data Transport in High-Speed, High-Delay Networks.....	11-4
11.7 Proposed Replacement Congestion-Control Mechanisms for the Internet.....	11-4

11.8 Evaluating Internet Congestion-Control Mechanisms.....	11-5
11.9 Internet Simulation and Models.....	11-6
11.10 Supporting Software Tools.....	11-7
11.11 Supporting Statistical Techniques.....	11-7
11.12 Empirical Internet Test Beds.....	11-7
11.13 General Related References.....	11-8
11.14 Analytical Network Models.....	11-8
Appendix A. Understanding and Improving Fluid-Flow Models.....	A-1
Appendix B. Computational Requirements: MesoNet vs. Hybrid Model.....	B-1
Appendix C. Supplementary Sensitivity Analysis Results.....	C-1

DRAFT